



MELBOURNE SOUTH YARRA RESIDENTS GROUP INC.

Established by the residents of South Yarra in 1969

23 July 2014

Michael Galimany
Heritage Officer
Heritage Victoria
Department of Transport, Planning and Local
Infrastructure
Level 11, 1 Spring Street
MELBOURNE VIC 3000

By email: michael.galimany@dtpli.vic.gov.au

Application VHR0019 - Melbourne Grammar School

We represent the interests of residents of South Yarra that reside in the City of Melbourne. Having considered this application and the information supplied in support, including the Heritage Impact Statement (HIS), we have serious concerns about its impact on the neighbouring area and as a consequence object to the project proceeding in its present form for the following reasons.

1. As stated in paragraph 8.1 of the HIS the design of the new building has a "bold contemporary demeanour". In our view a more accurate description of the building is a "corporate monolith".
2. The HIS does not include any elevations with the existing structure superimposed – as is done for the plan view. However, the proposed building is four storeys high and not three as is the situation at present. As a consequence of this, and when considering the colour of the building, we consider that the building will dominate the entire area and loom over the small scale heritage residences in the immediate area in both Bromby street and Domain street. Both streets contain heritage listed residences.
3. Fundamentally, the proposed building takes no account of the character of the neighbouring area.
4. The assessment of the impact of this project on the surrounding area made by the architects and Bryce Raworth Pty Ltd in the HIS are patently incorrect.
 - (a) "The scale of the building as seen from outside the campus echoes that of the buildings that are to be removed" (paragraph 8.0).

This is a four-storey building replacing a three-storey building constructed using materials that change the scale and visual impact of the building entirely. There is no similarity that could be construed as an "echo" in either footprint, volume, height or appearance.

- (b) "The works will result in some limited adverse impact upon the cultural significance of the broad heritage place..." (paragraph 10.0)

The adverse impact upon the surrounding low level heritage buildings will not be limited. It will be significant and should not be permitted. Clauses 43.01 and 22.05 of the relevant Melbourne Heritage Planning Scheme Provisions contain the following objectives, as acknowledged in the HIS.

"To conserve and enhance the character and appearance of precincts identified as heritage places by ensuring that any new development complements their character, scale, form and appearance."

5. Furthermore, these heritage planning provisions require the new building to meet the following criteria.
- (a) "The external shape of a new building... should be respectful in a Level 1 or 2 streetscape, or interpretative in a Level 3 streetscape."
 - (b) "The façade pattern and colours of a new building... should be respectful where visible in a Level 1 streetscape and interpretative elsewhere."
 - (c) "The surface materials of a new building... should always be respectful."
 - (d) "The height of a building should respect the character and scale of adjoining buildings and the streetscape. New buildings or additions within residential areas consisting of predominantly single and two-storey terrace houses should be respectful and interpretative."

The proposed new building is patently not "respectful" of any of these things and should not be approved as it is not an appropriate design response for the stated purpose in this heritage laden residential environment.

Yours faithfully



Michael Butcher
President

Cc Mr Stephen Vecris
Senior Planning Officer | Planning and Building
City of Melbourne
stephen.vecris@melbourne.vic.gov.au